



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 17, 2004

Mr. Dan Junell  
Assistant General Counsel  
Teacher Retirement System of Texas  
1000 Red River Street  
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2004-9767

Dear Mr. Junell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 212982.

The Teacher Retirement System of Texas (the "system") received a request for any information regarding a named individual and "her role in assisting Fort Worth ISD employees who wanted to buy more years into [the system]." You state that some responsive information has been released to the requestor. You claim that some of the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107, and 552.111 of the Government Code. In addition you have submitted information in Exhibit G for which you claim no exception, but that you claim the Fort Worth Independent School District ("FISD") may wish to withhold. *See generally* Gov't Code § 552.304 (allowing interested party to submit comments indicating why requested information should or should not be released). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, we address the system's claims under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 825.507 of the Government Code provides in relevant part:

(a) Records of a participant that are in the custody of the [Teacher Retirement System of Texas] or of an administrator, carrier, attorney, consultant, or governmental agency acting in cooperation with or on behalf of the retirement system are confidential and not subject to public disclosure in a form that would identify an individual and are exempt from the public access provisions of Chapter 552, except as otherwise provided by this section.

(b) The retirement system may release records of a participant, including a participant to which Chapter 803 [of the Government Code] applies, to:

(1) the participant or the participant's attorney or guardian or another person who the executive director determines is acting on behalf of the participant;

(2) the executor or administrator of the deceased participant's estate, including information relating to the deceased participant's beneficiary;

(3) a spouse or former spouse of the participant if the executive director determines that the information is relevant to the spouse's or former spouse's interest in member accounts, benefits, or other amounts payable by the retirement system;

(4) an administrator, carrier, consultant, attorney, or agent acting on behalf of the retirement system;

(5) a governmental entity, an employer, or the designated agent of an employer, only to the extent the retirement system needs to share the information to perform the purposes of the retirement system, as determined by the executive director;

(6) a person authorized by the participant in writing to receive the information;

(7) a federal or state criminal law enforcement agency that requests a record for a law enforcement purpose;

(8) the attorney general to the extent necessary to enforce child support; or

(9) a party in response to a subpoena issued under applicable law if the executive director determines that the participant will have a reasonable opportunity to contest the subpoena.

....

(g) In this section, "participant" means a member, former member, retiree, annuitant, beneficiary, or alternate payee of the retirement system.

Gov't Code § 825.507(a)-(b), (g). You inform us that the submitted information in Exhibit F relates to participants in the retirement system. You also state that the requestor has neither asserted that any of the provisions of section 825.507(b) are applicable in this instance nor provided any information that would allow the system to determine that any of these provisions applies. Based on your representations, we conclude that the information in Exhibit F must be withheld from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 825.507 of the Government Code.

Next, we address your claims under section 552.107 of the Government Code. Section 552.107(1) protects information coming within the attorney-client privilege. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002).

First, a governmental body must demonstrate that the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made "for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services" to the client governmental body. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *In re Texas Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in a capacity other than that of attorney). Because government attorneys often act in capacities other than that of professional legal counsel, including as administrators, investigators, or managers, the mere fact that a communication involves an attorney for the government does not demonstrate this element. Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, and lawyer representatives. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1)(A), (B), (C), (D), (E). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Finally, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a confidential communication, *id.* 503(b)(1), meaning it was "not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is

made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication.” *Id.* 503(a)(5).

Whether a communication meets the definition of a confidential communication depends on the intent of the parties involved at the time the information was communicated. *Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, no writ). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain that the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein). Having considered your representations and reviewed the information at issue, we find that you have established that the submitted information in Exhibits A through E constitute privileged attorney-client communications. We therefore find that this information may be withheld pursuant to section 552.107.

In summary, the information in Exhibit F must be withheld from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 825.507 of the Government Code. The system may withhold the information in Exhibits A through E pursuant to section 552.107(1) of the Government Code. As we have not received comments from FISD regarding Exhibit G and the information is not otherwise confidential by law, this information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records

will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Debbie K. Lee  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DKL/seg

Ref: ID# 212982

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Amie Streater  
Fort Worth Star-Telegram  
400 West Seventh Street  
Fort Worth, Texas 76101  
(w/o enclosures)